CONTENTS

ECONOMIC REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT.............................. 1
ANNUAL REPORT OF THE COUNCIL OF ECONOMIC ADVISERS* ... 7
CHAPTER 1 INCLUSIVE GROWTH IN THE UNITED STATES .... 21
CHAPTER 2 THE YEAR IN REVIEW AND THE YEARS AHEAD ... 51
CHAPTER 3 THE GLOBAL MACROECONOMIC SITUATION .... 119
CHAPTER 4 INEQUALITY IN EARLY CHILDHOOD AND EFFECTIVE PUBLIC POLICY INTERVENTIONS ... 153
CHAPTER 5 TECHNOLOGY AND INNOVATION ................. 207
CHAPTER 6 THE ECONOMIC BENEFITS OF INVESTING IN U.S. INFRASTRUCTURE ......................... 251
CHAPTER 7 THE 70TH ANNIVERSARY OF THE COUNCIL OF ECONOMIC ADVISERS......................... 291
REFERENCES .......................................................... 331
APPENDIX A REPORT TO THE PRESIDENT ON THE ACTIVITIES OF THE COUNCIL OF ECONOMIC ADVISERS DURING 2015 .................................................. 381
APPENDIX B STATISTICAL TABLES RELATING TO INCOME, EMPLOYMENT, AND PRODUCTION ............ 395

*For a detailed table of contents of the Council’s Report, see page 11.
ECONOMIC REPORT
OF THE
PRESIDENT
To the Congress of the United States:

When I took office, our Nation was in the midst of the worst recession since the Great Depression. The economy was shedding 800,000 jobs a month. The auto industry was on the brink of collapse, and our manufacturing sector was in decline. Many families were struggling to pay their bills and make ends meet. Millions more saw their savings evaporate, even as retirement neared.

Seven years later, thanks to the grit and determination of the American people, the United States of America has rebuilt, reformed, and emerged as the strongest, most durable economy in the world.

We are in the middle of the longest streak of private-sector job creation in history: 14 million new jobs; the strongest two years of job growth since the ‘90s; an unemployment rate cut in half. Manufacturing has added 900,000 jobs in the past six years, and our auto industry just had its best year of sales ever. We are less reliant on foreign oil than at any point in the previous four decades. Nearly 18 million people have gained health coverage under the Affordable Care Act, cutting the uninsured rate to a record low. And we’ve done all this while dramatically cutting our budget deficit.

In 2015, we continued to take steps forward, with strong job growth and wages rising at their fastest rate in the recovery. Here in Washington, Congress came together to pass a budget, secure long-term transportation funding, reform education laws, and make tax cuts for working families permanent.

So claims that America’s economy is in decline or that we haven’t made progress are simply not true. What is true—and the reason that a
lot of Americans feel anxious—is that the economy has been changing in profound ways, starting long before the Great Recession. Today, technology doesn’t just replace jobs on the assembly line, but rather affects any job where work can be automated. Companies in a global economy face tougher competition from abroad, and they can locate anywhere. As a result, workers have less leverage for a raise. And more and more wealth and income is concentrated at the very top.

All these trends have squeezed workers, making it difficult for middle-class families to feel secure, even when they have jobs and the economy is growing. For the past seven years, our goal has been not just strengthening economic growth but also creating an economy where everyone who works hard gets a fair shot. We’ve made progress. But we need to make more. And we must choose policies that not only make us stronger today, but also reflect the kind of country we aspire to be in the coming decades.

Real opportunity requires every American to get the education and training they need to land a good-paying job. Together, we’ve increased access to early childhood education, lifted high school graduation rates to new highs, and boosted graduates in fields like engineering. In the coming years, we should build on that progress, by providing pre-school for all, offering every student the hands-on computer science and math classes that make them job-ready on day one, and recruiting and supporting more great teachers for our kids. And we have to make college affordable for every American. Because no hardworking student should be saddled with unmanageable debt. We’ve already doubled investments in college scholarships and tax credits and capped student loan payments to 10 percent of a borrower’s income. Now, we need colleges to find innovative ways to cut costs and help more students finish their degrees.

Of course, a great education isn’t all we need in this new economy. We also need benefits and protections that provide a basic measure of security. Social Security and Medicare are more important than ever, and we shouldn’t weaken them; we should strengthen them. For Americans short of retirement, basic benefits should be just as mobile as everything else is today. That’s part of what the Affordable Care Act is all about. It helps fill the gaps in employer-based care so that when we lose a job, or go back to school, or start that new business, we’ll still have coverage.

We can build on this progress by further strengthening our social safety net and modernizing it for the changing economy. For example,
when a hardworking American loses his job—we shouldn’t just make sure he can get unemployment insurance; we should make sure that program encourages him to retrain for a business that’s ready to hire him. If that new job doesn’t pay as much, there should be a system of wage insurance in place so that he can still pay his bills. And even if he’s going from job to job, it shouldn’t be difficult for him to save for retirement and take his savings with him. That’s the way we make the economy work better for everyone.

But there are broader choices to make about what role the government should play in making sure the system’s not rigged in favor of the wealthiest and biggest corporations. A thriving private sector is the lifeblood of our economy, and we can all agree that there are outdated regulations that need to be changed, and red tape that needs to be cut. But after years of record corporate profits, working families won’t have more opportunities or see faster wage growth by letting the biggest companies make their own rules at the expense of everyone else; or by allowing attacks on collective bargaining to go unanswered.

In this new economy, workers and start-ups and small businesses need more of a voice, not less. The rules should work for them. And this year I plan to lift up the many businesses that have figured out that doing right by their workers ends up being good for their shareholders, their customers, and their communities, so that we can spread those best practices across America.

In fact, many of our best corporate citizens are also our most creative, and that spirit of innovation is essential to helping us meet our biggest challenges. Over the past seven years, we have nurtured that spirit by protecting an open Internet, creating online tools to help entrepreneurs start their businesses in a single day, and taking bold new steps to get more students and low-income Americans online. But we can do so much more, especially for medical research and clean energy sources. With 2015 marking the warmest year on record, we need to build on our existing investments in clean energy and accelerate the transition away from fossil fuels.

At the same time, I’ll keep pushing forward on work that still needs to be done, like fixing our broken immigration system, raising the minimum wage, providing two years of free community college to responsible students, ensuring equal pay for equal work, opening U.S. exports to new markets, and expanding tax cuts for low-income workers
without kids. All these things still matter to hardworking families; they are still the right thing to do, and I will not let up until they get done.

I have never been more optimistic about America’s future than I am today. Over the past seven years, I have seen the strength, resilience, and commitment of the American people. I know that when we are united in the face of challenges, our Nation emerges stronger and better than before. And when we work together, there are no limits to what we can achieve.

The White House
February 2016
THE ANNUAL REPORT
OF THE
COUNCIL OF ECONOMIC ADVISERS
LETTER OF TRANSMITTAL

COUNCIL OF ECONOMIC ADVISERS

Mr. President:


Sincerely yours,

Jason Furman
Chairman

Sandra E. Black
Member

Jay C. Shambaugh
Member
## CHAPTER 5
### TECHNOLOGY AND INNOVATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Competition and Dynamism Play a Critical Role</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Role of Startups</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declining Business Dynamism</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declining Labor Market Dynamism</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trends in R&amp;D Spending and Patenting</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Growth of Private R&amp;D and Decline of Public R&amp;D</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recent Trends in Patenting</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Opportunities and Challenges</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robotics</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effect of Robotics on Workers</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet and New Business Models</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Digital Divide Challenge</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 6
### THE ECONOMIC BENEFITS OF INVESTING IN U.S. INFRASTRUCTURE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economic Principles for Infrastructure Policy</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role of Government</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The State of U.S. Infrastructure</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Investment Levels</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation Infrastructure Quality</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congestion</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits of Investing in Infrastructure</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short-Term, Demand-Side Benefits</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-Term, Supply-Side Benefits</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure’s Direct Boost to Productivity</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure Investment and Agglomeration</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spillover Effects</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household Effects</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prospects for Increased Infrastructure Investment</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Interest Rates</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance and Repair</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing and Funding Infrastructure Projects</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>User Fees</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public-Private Partnerships</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## THE ROLE OF THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT

- Federal Grants ......................................................... 283
- Federal Lending and Loan Guarantees ......................... 284
- Tax-Exempt Bonds ..................................................... 285
- Build America Bonds .................................................. 286
- Recent Legislation ...................................................... 287

## CONCLUSION

- ................................. 289

## CHAPTER 7

### THE 70TH ANNIVERSARY OF THE COUNCIL OF ECONOMIC ADVISERS

- ................................. 291

### GOALS AND DUTIES

- Origins of CEA—Legislative History of the Employment Act of 1946 .................................................. 292
- Institutional Structure .................................................. 294
- Policy Focus ............................................................. 295

### HELP TO DEVELOP ECONOMIC POLICY

- Keyserling and “Full-Employment Economics” ................. 300
- The Heller Council and the 1964 Tax Cut ......................... 301
- Countercyclical Policy in Other Administrations ............... 303
- Microeconomic Policy .................................................. 306
- Ensuring that Policies are in the Public Interest ................ 309

### HELP TO ADVANCE THE PRESIDENT’S ECONOMIC AGENDA

- Nourse and Keyserling ................................................. 314
- Institutional Lessons .................................................... 316

### GATHER, ANALYZE, AND INTERPRET INFORMATION ON ECONOMIC TRENDS AND DEVELOPMENTS

- The Burns Council and the 1953-54 Recession .................. 319
- The 1970s and Stagflation ............................................. 323

### ENGAGE THE ECONOMICS COMMUNITY

- The Origins of Economists in the White House ................ 324
- Institutional Advantages and Challenges ....................... 325

### CONCLUSION

- ................................. 329

### REFERENCES

- ................................. 331
**APPENDIXES**

A. Report to the President on the Activities of the Council of Economic Advisers During 2015 ........................................ 381

B. Statistical Tables Relating to Income, Employment, and Production ......................................................... 395

**FIGURES**


1.2a. Share of Total, Labor, Capital Income Accruing to Top 1 Percent Based on Piketty-Saez Data .............................. 26

1.2b. Share of Total, Labor, Capital Income Accruing to Top 1 Percent Based on Congressional Budget Office Data .................. 26

1.3. Distribution of Household Wealth (Survey of Consumer Finances), 1989-2013 .................................................. 29

1.4. Distribution of Household Wealth (Saez-Zucman), 1913-2012 ...... 30

1.5. Intergenerational Earnings Mobility .................................. 32

1.6a. The “Great Gatsby Curve” Within the United States ............... 35

1.6b. The “Great Gatsby Curve” Across Countries .......... 35

1.7. Change in Employment by Detailed Occupation, 1989-2015 ...... 37

1.8. U.S. Union Membership & Top 10 Percent Income Share, 1917-2015 ................................................................. 40

1.9. Corporate Profits and Real Interest Rates, 1985-2015 .......... 41


1.11. Share of Workers with a State Occupational License ............ 43


2-1. Unemployment Rate, 1975-2015 ...................................... 52

2-2. Oil and Commodity Prices, 2014-2015 ............................... 54


2-5. Government Purchases as Share of Nominal GDP, 1948-2015 ..... 61

2-6. Forecast of Federal Funds Rate at Year End 2015 ................. 61

2-iii. Real State and Local Government Purchases During Recoveries, 1960-2015 ......................................................... 62

2-iv. State and Local Government Surplus as Percent of Nominal GDP, 1947-2015 ............................................................. 63


2-7. 12-Month Change in Nonfarm Payroll Employment, 2007-2015 ...... 66

2-8. Actual and Consensus Forecast Unemployment Rate, 2008-2020 ... 67

2-9. Unemployment Rate by Duration, 1990-2015 ....................... 68


2-13. Real Growth in GDP, Private Domestic Final Purchases (PDFP), and Gross Domestic Output (GDO), 2007-2015 .................. 73

2-14. Personal Saving Rate, 2000-2015 ................................... 75
3.i. Actual and Forecasted Working-Age Population by Region, 1950-2070 .................................................. 126
3.ii. Actual and Forecasted Dependency Ratios by Region, 1950-2070 126
3.iii. Real GDP Growth and Demographic Trends, 1989-2013 .......... 127
3.5. Current Account Balance as a Share of GDP, 2015 ..................... 129
3.6. Real GDP, 2008-2015 ........................................ 131
3.7. Percent Gap Between Actual and Projected (Oct-2010): Cumulative Real GDP Growth between 2010 and 2015 .... 132
3.8. Euro Area Sovereign Interest Rate Spreads Over Germany, 2007-2015 ........................................ 132
3.vi. Change in Commodity Futures Prices, June to December 2015 . . 142
3.11. Brazil’s Current Account Balance .................................. 145
3.15. Composition of U.S. Imports, 2015 .................................. 147
3.16. China’s Foreign Exchange Rate and Trading Band, 2011-2015 ... 149
3.17. China’s Foreign Exchange Rate and Trading Band, 2011-2015 ... 149
4.1. Cognitive and Non-Cognitive Skills SES Gaps are Mostly Established by Kindergarten .................................. 157
4.2. Official Poverty Rate for Households with Children by Householder Characteristic, 2014 ........................................ 158
4.3. Likelihood of Scoring Very Low on Early Health Measures ....... 160
4.4. Household Food Insecurity Rates, 2014 .............................. 161
4.5. Disparities in Underlying Factors Behind Outcome Gaps ........... 162
4.6. Likelihood of Scoring Very Low on Measures of Cognition at Age 5, 2006 .................................................. 163
4.7. Achievement Gap is Largely Set by Age 5 ............................ 164
4.8. Likelihood of Scoring Very Low on Behavioral Indexes at Age 5, 2006 .................................................. 165
4.9. Mother’s Time Spent on Child Care by Educational Attainment, 1965—2008 .................................................. 166
4.11. Preschool Enrollment by Mother’s Education, 2014 ............... 168
4.12. Annual Cost of Juvenile Incarceration vs. Other Youth Investments .................................................. 175
4.13. Low Birth Weight by Maternal Socioeconomic Status, 1989—2011 .................................................. 177
4.15. Effects of WIC Participation on Birth Outcomes, 1994—2004 ........ 185
4.16. Impact of Food Stamp Exposure on Metabolic Syndrome by Age of First Exposure ......................................................... 187
4.17. Long-Term Impacts of Exposure to Food Stamps as a Child. .... 187
4.18. Most Early Childhood Programs Have Positive Cognitive and Achievement Impacts ................................................ 198
4.19. Net Benefit Per Child of Perry Preschool Rises Over the Lifecycle. 199
4.20. Increase in Probability of Survival Past Age 60-80 Among Mothers’ Pension Recipients, 1965—2012 ..................... 204
4.21. Average Annual Earnings in Adulthood Among Children Younger than 13 When Their Family Participated in MTO, 2008—2012 .... 205
5.1. Labor Productivity Growth, 1955-2010 ............................... 208
5.2. Quantity and Volume of Venture Capital Deals, 1995-2015 ....... 214
5.3. Firm Entry and Exit Rates in the United States, 1977-2013 ........ 215
5.i. Share of Workers with a State Occupational License, 1950-2008 ... 216
5.5. Federal and Nonfederal Research and Development as a Share of GDP, 1953-2015 .......................................................... 224
5.6. Real Private Research & Development (R&D) Investment Growth, 2001-2015 ................................................................. 224
5.8. Share of Research and Development (R&D) by Funding Source, 2011 .......................................................... 226
5.9. Gross Domestic Expenditure on Research and Development (R&D), 2013 .......................................................... 227
5.11. Estimated Worldwide Annual Supply of Industrial Robots, 2004-2014 .......................................................... 233
5.12. Estimated Annual Shipments of Industrial Robots by Main Industries, 2010-2012 .......................................................... 234
5.15. Probability of Automation by an Occupation’s Median Hourly Wage .......................................................... 239
5.16. Share of Information and Communications Technology (ICT) in Value Added, 2011 .......................................................... 241
5.1ii. New York City Taxi Medallion Transactions, 2010-2015 ........ 243
5.1iv. Chicago Taxi Medallion Transactions, 2011-2015 ............... 244
5.17 Household Income and Home Internet Use, 2014 .................. 246
6.1. Composition of Public Spending on Water and Transportation Infrastructure as a Share of GDP, 1956-2014 ..................... 255
6.3 Average Age of Public Structures, 1956-2014 ........................ 257
6.4 Quality of U.S. Infrastructure, 2006-2015 ................................. 257
6.5. Government Bond Yields, 1965-2015 ..................................... 275
6.6. Relationship between Output Growth and the Ratio of Maintenance Investment to New Infrastructure Investment ................. 277
6.7. Ratio of Public Spending on Operation and Maintenance to Public Spending on New Capital, 1956-2014 ......................... 278

TABLES
1.1. Increase in Income Share Accounted for by Inequality Within Labor Income ........................................................................ 27
1.2. Change in Market Concentration by Sector, 1997-2007 ................. 42
2-ii. Job Growth Consistent with Unemployment and Participation Paths ................................................................................. 72
2-1. Selected Interest Rates, 2015 ...................................................... 107
2-2. Administration Economic Forecast ............................................. 108
2-3. Supply-Side Components of Actual and Potential Real Output Growth, 1953-2026 ................................................................. 113
5.1. Contribution to Average Annual Growth of R&D Investment ......... 225
6.1. Quality of Infrastructure in G-7 Member Countries ..................... 259
6.3. Input-Output Effects of Infrastructure Investment ....................... 263
6.4. Direct Contribution of the Public Capital Stock to Productivity Growth ...................................................................................... 270

BOXES
Box 1-1: Macroeconomic Rebalancing ................................................. 24
Box 2-1: Private Domestic Final Purchases as a Predictive Indicator of GDP ...................................................................................... 45
Box 2-1: Impact of Oil Price Declines on Spending and Production ... 55
Box 2-2: Challenges in the State and Local Sector ................................ 62
Box 2-3: Expectations for Future Job Growth ....................................... 72
Box 2-4: A Better Measure of Output: Gross Domestic Output (GDO) . 76
Box 2-6: Constraints on Housing Supply ............................................. 87
Box 2-7: Slowdown in Investment Growth across Advanced Economies ................................................................................. 92
Box 2-8: Policy Proposals to Raise Output over the Next-Ten Years ... 110
Box 2-9: Stable Inflation Rate of Unemployment .................................. 114
Box 3-1: Changing Demographic Trends and Global Growth ............. 125
Box 3-2: Market Volatility in the Second Half of 2015 ......................... 136
Box 3-3: Commodity Prices and Inflation in the Global Economy ....... 142
Box 3-4: The Importance of the Trans-Pacific Partnership (TPP) for the U.S. Economy ................................................................. 150
Box 4-1: Gender Differences in Early Outcomes and Responses to Investment ................................................................................. 170
Box 4-2: Types of Public Investment .................................................... 173
Box 4-3: Federal Early Childhood Programs: An Overview ................. 178
Box 4-4: Technological Innovation that Stimulates Learning during Out-of-School Time ............................................................... 189
Box 4-5: Nutrition and Income Programs Help Sustain Human Capital Development throughout Childhood ................................. 201